Durham Research Online

Deposited in DRO:
14 November 2017

Version of attached file:
Published Version

Peer-review status of attached file:
Peer-reviewed

Citation for published item:

Further information on publisher’s website:
https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevLett.119.184502

Publisher’s copyright statement:
Reprinted with permission from the American Physical Society: Reeves, Matthew T., Billam, Thomas P., Yu, Xiaoquan Bradley, Ashton S. (2017). Enstrophy Cascade in Decaying Two-Dimensional Quantum Turbulence. Physical Review Letters 119(18): 184502 © 2017 by the American Physical Society. Readers may view, browse, and/or download material for temporary copying purposes only, provided these uses are for noncommercial personal purposes. Except as provided by law, this material may not be further reproduced, distributed, transmitted, modified, performed, displayed, published, or sold in whole or part, without prior written permission from the American Physical Society.

Additional information:

Use policy
The full-text may be used and/or reproduced, and given to third parties in any format or medium, without prior permission or charge, for personal research or study, educational, or not-for-profit purposes provided that:

- a full bibliographic reference is made to the original source
- a link is made to the metadata record in DRO
- the full-text is not changed in any way

The full-text must not be sold in any format or medium without the formal permission of the copyright holders.

Please consult the full DRO policy for further details.
Enstrophy Cascade in Decaying Two-Dimensional Quantum Turbulence

Matthew T. Reeves1,2,*, Thomas P. Billam3,†, Xiaoquan Yu1, and Ashton S. Bradley1
1Department of Physics, Centre for Quantum Science, and Dodd-Walls Centre for Photonic and Quantum Technologies, University of Otago, Dunedin, New Zealand
2Australian Research Council Centre of Excellence in Future Low-Energy Electronics Technologies, School of Mathematics and Physics, University of Queensland, St Lucia, QLD 4072, Australia
3Joint Quantum Centre (JQC) Durham–Newcastle, School of Mathematics and Statistics, Newcastle University, Newcastle upon Tyne NE1 7RU, United Kingdom
(Received 14 February 2017; published 31 October 2017)

We report evidence for an enstrophy cascade in large-scale point-vortex simulations of decaying two-dimensional quantum turbulence. Devising a method to generate quantum vortex configurations with kinetic energy narrowly localized near a single length scale, the dynamics are found to be well characterized by a superfluid Reynolds number $R_e$ that depends only on the number of vortices and the initial kinetic energy scale. Under free evolution the vortices exhibit features of a classical enstrophy cascade, including a $k^{-3}$ power-law kinetic energy spectrum, and constant enstrophy flux associated with inertial transport to small scales. Clear signatures of the cascade emerge for $N \geq 500$ vortices. Simulating up to very large Reynolds numbers ($N = 32,768$ vortices), additional features of the classical theory are observed: the Kraichnan-Batchelor constant is found to converge to $C' \approx 1.6$, and the width of the $k^{-3}$ range scales as $R_e^{1/2}$.

DOI: 10.1103/PhysRevLett.119.184502

Introduction.—Quantum vortices in atomic Bose-Einstein condensates (BECs) offer the possibility not only to physically realize the point-vortex model envisaged by Onsager [1] but also to observe and manipulate it at the level of individual quanta. Experiments have recently demonstrated controllable generation of quantum vortices [2–5], hard-wall trapping potentials containing large, uniform density condensates [6,7], and measurements of vortex circulation [8] and vortex decay processes [2,9,10]. Since well-separated 2D quantum vortices behave as idealized point vortices [11,12], two-dimensional quantum turbulence (2DQT) can be considered a “stripped-down” model of hydrodynamic turbulence with a definite number of degrees of freedom, and thus studying the analogies between 2DQT and 2D classical turbulence (2DCT) may expand our understanding of universal turbulent phenomena. The recent experimental observation of a von Kármán vortex street and the transition to turbulence in the wake of a stirring obstacle [13], for example, adds to evidence that the classical Reynolds number concept may be generalized to turbulence in superfluids [14–16].

The enstrophy cascade of decaying 2DCT predicted by Batchelor [17] is a key process of classical turbulence for which the quantum analogue has remained unexplored. While much theoretical attention has focused on the inverse energy cascade of forced turbulence [18–22] and vortex clustering in negative temperature equilibria [23–26], a clear demonstration of an enstrophy cascade has yet to be presented. A challenge in numerically demonstrating such a cascade in 2DQT is obtaining a sufficiently large vortex number and range of wave numbers $k$ to identify the steep associated energy spectrum $E(k) \propto k^{-3}$ over a significant range of scale space. In this Letter we directly simulate an $N$-point-vortex model of decaying 2D quantum turbulence at large $N$. We devise a method of constructing an initial condition with a large energy contained within a single wave number, allowing us to simulate the 2DQT analog of a scenario where the existence of an enstrophy cascade is well established in 2DCT [27,28]. The system is found to be well-characterized by a superfluid Reynolds number $R_e$ that depends only on the number of vortices and the initial wave number $k_i$. We show that under free evolution the $k^{-3}$ spectrum of the energy cascade emerges for $N \geq 500$, and the associated enstrophy and energy fluxes are found to agree with the Batchelor theory. By increasing $N$ up to 32,768, additional key features of the theory are verified: the Kraichnan-Batchelor constant is found to be $C' \approx 1.6$, close to the accepted classical value, and the length of the inertial range scales as $R_e^{1/2}$.

Background.—Turbulent flows at large Reynolds numbers (Re) can spontaneously develop self-similar cascade solutions, in which quantities are conservatively transported across a subregion of scale space called the inertial range. Two-dimensional turbulence cannot support the usual Kolmogorov energy cascade of 3D turbulence, since the mean square vorticity, or enstrophy is unable to be amplified through vortex stretching. However, Batchelor [17] hypothesized that the enstrophy itself could therefore undergo a cascade, from small to large wave numbers, via a filamentation of vorticity patches. The enstrophy cascade is signified by a kinetic energy spectrum $E(k) = C' \eta^{1/3} k^{-3}$ (subject to a weak logarithmic correction [29]), where $\eta$ is the enstrophy dissipation rate, assumed equal to the enstrophy flux in the inertial range, and $C'$ is the Kraichnan-Batchelor constant. The lossless cascade terminates at a dissipation...
wave number $k_d \sim k_d \Re^{1/2}$, at which viscous dissipation becomes important. The enstrophy cascade must be accompanied by a drift of energy to small wave numbers, in order to be simultaneously consistent with the conservation laws of energy and enstrophy. Importantly, however, strong, long-lived coherent vortices, strongly dependent on the initial conditions, appear and can inhibit the self-similar cascade [28,30,31]. These laminar objects typically introduce a steeper spectral slope [32,33], on top of the $k^{-3}$ turbulent background, recoverable via filtering [34].

Model.—We consider a quantum fluid, such as a BEC, characterized by healing length $\xi$ and speed of sound $c$, carrying quantized vortices of charge $\kappa_i = \pm 1$ and circulation $\Gamma_i = \kappa_i \Gamma$ [35]. For a quasi-2D system, vortex bending is suppressed and the dynamics become effectively two-dimensional [36]. In the low Mach number limit, where the average intervortex distance $\ell$ is much greater than the healing length $\xi$, interactions between vortices and density fluctuations can be ignored on scales $\gtrsim \xi$. In this limit a fully compressible (e.g., Gross-Pitaevskii [37]) description, that complicates interpretation of fluxes [38], is not needed. Instead, the motion of the $i$th quantum vortex, located at $\mathbf{r}_i$, can be described by a dissipative point-vortex model [39] with compressible effects (at length scales $\lesssim \xi$) added phenomenologically [38,40]. The motion of the $i$th quantum vortex, located at $\mathbf{r}_i$, is given by

$$\frac{d\mathbf{r}_i}{dt} = \mathbf{v}_i + \mathbf{w}_i; \quad \mathbf{v}_i = \sum_{j=1,j \neq i}^{N} \mathbf{v}^{(j)}_i; \quad \mathbf{w}_i = -\gamma \kappa_i \hat{e}_3 \times \mathbf{v}_i, \quad (1)$$

where $\gamma$ is the dissipation rate, $\hat{e}_3$ is a unit vector perpendicular to the fluid plane, and $\mathbf{v}_i$ and $\mathbf{w}_i$ are the conservative and dissipative parts of the velocity, respectively. The dissipation rate $\gamma$ arises from thermal friction due to the normal fluid component, here assumed to be stationary [9]. Phenomenologically, we remove opposite-sign vortex pairs separated by less than $\xi$ (modeling dipole annihilation), and smoothly increase the dissipation $\gamma$ for same-sign vortex pairs as their separation decreases to around $\xi$ (modeling sound radiation by accelerating vortices [41]). Details are provided in the Supplemental Material [42].

The velocity of the $i$th vortex due to the $j$th vortex, $\mathbf{v}^{(j)}_i$, is obtained from a Hamiltonian point-vortex model subject to appropriate boundary conditions. We consider a doubly periodic square box [51–54] with side length $L \gg \xi$, for which [55]

$$\mathbf{v}^{(j)}_i = \frac{\pi c \kappa_j}{(L/\xi)} \sum_{m=-\infty}^{\infty} \left( \frac{\sin(y_j')}{\cosh(x_j' - 2m) - \cos(x_j')} \frac{\sin(x_j')}{\cosh(x_j' - 2m) - \cos(x_j')} \right). \quad (2)$$

where $(x_j', y_j')/(2\pi/L) \equiv \mathbf{r}_j \equiv \mathbf{r}_i - \mathbf{r}_j$. The absence of a physical boundary offers the usual advantage: vortices cannot reach their own images, enforcing conservation of the (zero) net vorticity. This helps achieve statistical homogeneity and isotropy, as required for comparison with Batchelor’s theory.

**Spectrum.**—The kinetic energy spectrum (per unit mass) in the periodic box is given by [23]

$$E(k) = E_{\text{self}}(k) + E_{\text{int}}(k) \quad (3)$$

$$= \frac{4}{(\pi kL)^2} \sum_{i=1}^{N} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \langle \kappa_i \kappa_j \cos(\mathbf{k} \cdot \mathbf{r}_{ij}) \rangle, \quad (4)$$

where $\mathbf{k} = (n_x \Delta k, n_y \Delta k)$ for $n_x, n_y \in \mathbb{Z}$, $\Delta k = 2\pi/L$, and $\langle \rangle$ denotes ensemble averaging. The average kinetic energy is $\sum_k E(k) \langle \Delta k \rangle^2 = E_{\text{self}} + E_{\text{int}}$. The self-energy term is, for fixed $N$, a cutoff-dependent constant, set by $L$ and the vortex core structure at wave numbers $k \gtrsim \xi^{-1}$ [23] (not considered here). The time evolution of $E(k)$ governs the spectral transport of kinetic energy: $dE(k)/dt = T(k) + D(k)$. where $T(k)$ is the transfer function, given by

$$T(k) = -\frac{4}{(\pi kL)^2} \sum_{i=1}^{N} \sum_{j=1}^{N} \langle \kappa_i \kappa_j \sin(\mathbf{k} \cdot \mathbf{r}_{ij}) \rangle \cdot (\mathbf{v}_i - \mathbf{v}_j), \quad (5)$$

and $D(k)$ is the dissipation spectrum, obtained from Eq. (5) by setting $\mathbf{v} \rightarrow \mathbf{w}$. As usual, the enstrophy and energy spectra are related via $\Omega(k) = 2k^2 E(k)$. Like its classical counterpart, the superfluid transfer function $T(k)$ conservatively redistributes energy, with $\sum_k T(k) \langle \Delta k \rangle^2 = 0$. The dissipation spectrum $D(k)$ governs the rate of energy loss: $\sum_k D(k) \langle \Delta k \rangle^2 = dE/dt < 0$. Angularly integrated spectral measures $E(k) = \int d\phi_k k E(k)$, etc., are analyzed by defining a discrete angular integral over a ring of wave numbers: $\tilde{f}(n \Delta k) = \sum_{k \in \tilde{D}(n)} f(k) \Delta k$, where $\tilde{D}(n) = \{k | |n - 1/2| \Delta k \leq |k| \leq (n + 1/2) \Delta k\}$, and $n = 1, 2, \ldots$. Hence we may define the discrete energy and enstrophy fluxes [56,57]

$$\tilde{\Pi}_e(n \Delta k) = -\sum_{m=1}^{n} \tilde{T}(m \Delta k) \Delta k, \quad (6)$$

$$\tilde{\Pi}_w(n \Delta k) = -2 \sum_{m=1}^{n} (m \Delta k)^2 \tilde{T}(m \Delta k) \Delta k \quad (7)$$

that represent the instantaneous energy and enstrophy fluxes through the $k$-space bin $|k| = n \Delta k$. Cascades can be expected when $\gamma \ll 1$ and $T(k)$ is large, such that lossless transport is established over some range of $k$.

**Dynamics.**—We simulate the dynamics of neutral point-vortex systems with fixed $L = 10^4 \xi$, fixed dissipation $\gamma = 10^{-4}$ [58,59], and vortex numbers $N = 2^n$, $n \in \{9, 10, \ldots, 15\}$ [60]. The initial conditions are such that only a thin shell of wave numbers of width $\Delta k$, localized near an initial wave number $k_i$, are excited with random...
phases, as is often considered classically [28,52]. To generate such configurations with point vortices, we construct the corresponding classical vorticity field, which is dominated by a few circular coherent vortices [Fig. 1(d)], whose size and number were found to depend on the initial conditions [42]. These structures can be traced back through the dynamics, without interruption, to intensely concentrated clusters in the initial distribution. By this time the $k^{-3}$ spectrum has collapsed; the regions of low and high $k$ in the spectra were found to be very near constant when multiplied by $k^{-2/2}$ and $k^{-3/2}$, respectively.

Inspection of the energy and enstrophy fluxes confirms the directions of spectral transport. The early developing stages of evolution [Fig. 1(b)] clearly demonstrate the development of a negative energy flux (indicating flow to low $k$) and positive enstrophy flux (indicating flow to high $k$) in the mutually exclusive wave number regions $k < k_i$ and $k > k_i$, respectively. The time frame of matured turbulent activity, which exhibits the $k^{-3}$ spectrum, is corroborated by a nearly constant enstrophy flux over approximately one decade of wave numbers [Fig. 1(c)], providing a means to estimate the Kraichnan-Batchelor constant via the compensated kinetic energy spectrum: $C' = E(k)k^3/\eta^{2/3}$, where $\eta = \Pi_\omega$ averaged over $k$, time window, and ensemble [42]. The late stages dominated by coherent vortices exhibit negligible flux compared to the earlier turbulent dynamics [Fig. 1(d)].
The dissipation scale in the Kolmogorov energy cascade. Note, however, here the cascade terminates due to a crossover from many-vortex to single-vortex physics, rather than due to dissipative effects, and suggests that the point-vortex system can effectively be truncated at wave numbers \( k \sim k_f \), as argued by Kraichnan [68].

Further study is certainly warranted. A more extensive study of the effects of initial conditions is needed to elucidate the role of coherent structures in 2DQT; it seems likely, however, that their influence will be as important as in 2DCT, as here we have already seen, perhaps unsurprisingly, that they readily appear and are dependent on the initial conditions. Furthermore, it now appears probable that the dual inverse-energy and direct-enstrophy cascades [56] could manifest in forced 2DQT under the appropriate conditions. Although a previous study showed evidence of the inverse energy cascade in a forced point-vortex model [22], the Kraichnan-Kolmogorov constant was found to be twice the accepted value, seemingly at odds with the results here as well as those from 3DQT. However in Ref. [22] forcing was introduced by essentially reversing the sign of \( \gamma \). Adapting our rejection-sampling method to dynamically introduce vorticity instead could provide a more physical minimal model of forced 2DQT [21].

Studying the forced case would allow a more accurate determination of the Kraichnan-Batchelor constant, but also exploration of intermittency effects [65], and the logarithmic correction in the enstrophy cascade [29,69,70], if large enough vortex numbers and simulations times can be achieved [34,54]. It will also be interesting to explore the relation between the enstrophy cascade observed here and the anomalous scaling at nonthermal fixed points in compressible decaying 2DQT [71,72].

Finally, regarding the prospect of observing the cascade in atomic condensates, the main challenge would be creating a system large enough relative to the healing length \( \xi \), to remain within the low Mach number regime where analogies to the Navier-Stokes equations are valid. For our smallest vortex number, \( N = 512 \), the Mach number Ma = \( v_{rms}/c \approx 0.025 \) and hence the system size could be reduced to \( L/\xi \sim 800 \) without invalidating the incompressibility assumption \( v_{rms}/c \lesssim 0.3 \) [in Eqs. (1) and (2)] \( \{x,L\} \rightarrow \lambda \{x,L\} \) gives \( v \rightarrow \lambda^{-1}v \), \( t \rightarrow \lambda^2t \). For comparison, recent experiments in uniform systems have achieved \( L \sim 200\xi \) [7]. While fewer vortices would allow for a smaller system, given the rather limited range of \( k^{-3} \) behavior for \( N = 512 \) it is questionable whether the cascade theory would be valid in systems containing significantly fewer vortices. Nonetheless, full Gross-Pitaevskii simulations for the smaller values of \( N \) considered here are well within computational reach, and would provide useful information regarding the effects of physical boundaries, as well as the effects of compressibility and vortex annihilations, which can be tuned through varying the system size for a fixed vortex number and initial condition [38].
Conclusion.—We have numerically observed signatures of an enstrophy cascade in decaying 2DQT, including a $k^{-3}$ power-law spectrum, constant enstrophy flux over a wide inertial range, and a Kraichnan-Batchelor constant converging to $C \approx 1.6$ for large vortex number. We have shown that the extent of the inertial range scales as $\text{Re}^{1/2}$ for a suitably defined superfluid Reynolds number $\text{Re}$, that depends only on the number of vortices and the length scale where kinetic energy is initially concentrated. The relevance of the classical cascade theory for describing decaying 2DQT suggests some features of decaying turbulence may be universal across classical and quantum fluids. Further insight could be gained by testing measures beyond two-point correlations, such as coherent structure profiles or intermittency statistics. Signatures of the enstrophy cascade become observable for systems of a few hundred vortices, and may soon be within reach of cold-atom 2DQT experiments.

We thank B. P. Anderson for many stimulating discussions and A. J. Groszek for valuable comments. A. S. B. was supported by a Rutherford Discovery Fellowship administered by the Royal Society of New Zealand. M. T. R. was partially supported by the Australian Research Council and A. J. Groszek for valuable comments. A. S. B. was supported by a Rutherford Discovery Fellowship administered by the Royal Society of New Zealand. M. T. R. was partially supported by the Australian Research Council and A. J. Groszek for valuable comments.

\[ \frac{m}{h^2} = \text{m} \text{reeves@uq.edu.au} \]
\[ \text{thomas биллам@newcastle.ac.uk} \]

[35] In the case of an atomic BEC, one has $\xi = h/\sqrt{\mu m}$, $c = \sqrt{\mu m}$, $\Gamma = h/m$, where $\mu$ is the chemical potential and $m$ is the mass of a constituent particle.
The point-vortex approximation requires that $u_{\text{rms}} \ll c$, so in this sense, for the given parameters, the largest $N$ simulations are not physically reasonable. However, our choice of $L$ is somewhat arbitrary, and the rescaling $\{x, L\} \rightarrow \lambda \{x, L\}$ (for fixed $\xi$) yields $v_{\text{rms}} \rightarrow v_{\text{rms}}/\lambda$.

The superfluid Reynolds number introduced in Ref. [16] may be more appropriate in the presence of a stirring potential.

Some variation of $C'$ with the initial conditions or Reynolds number is expected [28, 54, 56].